

# Evaluation of Work Placement Program; Using the CIPP Evaluation Model

Syamsurizal<sup>1</sup>, Madhakomala<sup>2</sup>, Dewi Susita<sup>3</sup>

Universitas Negeri Jakarta<sup>1</sup>, Universitas Negeri Jakarta<sup>2</sup>, Universitas Negeri Jakarta<sup>3</sup>

**Abstract:-** This research was conducted to evaluate the effectiveness of Work Placement Program (WPP) in Polytechnic of LP3I Jakarta (PLJ). This research uses the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model to evaluate the Work Placement Program in PLJ. Four model were applied to evaluate the WPP: 1) The Context evaluation of the legal foundation, vision and mission of PLJ, Strategic Plan and Work placement program objectives, 2) The Input evaluation of organizational structure, work placement procedures, student recruitment, lecturers' readiness, curriculum, adequate facilities, infrastructure, company mapping, 3) The process evaluation of Student selection process, curriculum conformity, supply process, implementation of work placement in company, and report, 4) The Product evaluation of the implementation of student competence, student absorption that works, work ethic, corporate satisfaction, benefits of work placement program in the company. Informants of this study are students, employees of the work placement section, vice directors of PLJ, lecturers and companies. The research result found that The context evaluation is based on The LP3I Jakarta Master Plan of PLJ with very good criteria, The input evaluation assessed in Good Criteria, The Process Evaluation assessed in good and satisfactory criteria, The Product evaluation assesses in good and satisfactory criteria.

**Keywords:** Work placement program, CIPP evaluation model (Context-Input-Procces-Product).

## I. INTRODUCTION

The number of Indonesian Educated unemployed is 856,644 people. It consisted of 249,705 academy / diploma graduates and 606,939 university graduates. Total educated unemployment is equivalent to 12.2% of 7,005,262 open unemployment (BPS, 2017).

The above phenomenon indicates there are still universities have not succeeded in producing graduates who are able to compete gaining employment in the industrial world. It happened because the graduates did not have the skills and expertise needed by the industry. It is contrary to the function of higher education as the center of producing such human resources, a quality and competitively qualified human resources (RI Law No.12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education Article 5).

The Polytechnic of LP3I Jakarta (PLJ) is one of the vocational higher education institutions in Indonesia. The aim of the establishment of PLJ is to create human

resources that have a competitiveness, skill, and expertise in their fields to work in the industrial world. In realizing the above objectives, PLJ collaborates with industry parties in internship and work placement programs. The unit that handles the program is under the coordination of the Deputy Director III PLJ. The program produced a fairly positive response in the past three years. It is proven by the finding of increasing demand for students to work as well as work for PLJ partner companies. From 2015-2017 the demand for labor from companies to PLJ has totaled 6,497 people (LP3I Polytechnic Job Placement Section Jakarta, 2017). However, the advantages above do not mean without obstacles. In fact, There are still level III active students who do not meet the job placement requirements. The number of level III active students who do not meet the job placement requirements is quite high, which is an annual average of 437 students from 1,582 active third-level students, while students who meet the conditions of work and internship are on average 966 students and students who are not accepted there are 179 students (LP3I Polytechnic Job Placement Section Jakarta, 2017).

There are several problems faced by the LP3i Jakarta polytechnic in the implementation of work placement programs are: 1) Some students who do not succeed in passing the selection test by the company because the student does not meet the desired qualifications of the company, 2) Some students who have accepted work or internships in the company have a bad attitude (attitude) during the trial period of work in the company, 3) The next problem there are some students who are placed in work in the company not in accordance with the competencies they have or their majors, 4) There are some companies that provide wages below the minimum wage set by the government.

The phenomenon above proves that there is still a need for improvement in the learning process both in terms of curriculum, lecturers, facilities, infrastructure and improvement in cooperation with companies, as well as in coaching and mentoring students on work placements and internships. In conclusion, the focus of this research is the evaluation of the student work placement program at the LP3I Polytechnic in Jakarta. This study will explore: a) Policy base for work placement programs, b) Planning work placement programs, c) The process of implementing work placement programs, d) Achievement of the results of work placement programs, e) Results of changes in student work behavior, f) Results and impacts from the application of student work skills obtained by the company. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the work placement program so that it can determine the level of performance,

program weaknesses and continuation of work placement programs for students.

## II. LITERATURE REVIEW

### ➤ *Work Placement Program*

The Work Placement Program is a process of activities carried out to prepare and conduct work placements for final year students of Polytechnic LP3I Jakarta. The work placement program is under the coordination of Deputy Director III Polytechnic LP3I Jakarta. The aim of this work placement program is that students can practice work skills at the Company and get work experience directly from the workplace. (LP3I Polytechnic Job Placement Section Jakarta, 2017). According to Clark & Zukas (2016) that work placement programs are very helpful for students in improving work skills and increasing work experience and knowledge, this has been proven that students who complete a 1-year work placement program at a company and continue their studies at university show better performance and academic improvement compared to students who do not take the placement program. Work experience gained by students from industry is part of learning in higher education because it is very useful for final year students in improving their skills, knowledge and work abilities (Brooks & Youngson, 2016).

Higher Education not only prepares students with employability in class, but also students must gain actual work experience in the industry. Through the work placement program, students can apply and improve their communication skills, teamwork, confidence, organizational skills, analytical skills and decision-making skills.

### ➤ *CIPP Model*

The CIPP model was first presented by Stufflebeam which included evaluating context, input, process and product. CIPP is a model that is currently often used by educational evaluators. This is because this model is fairly objective and effective in its perspective on a program. Stufflebeam said that "The CIPP Model reflects an Objectivist orientation. Objectivist evaluations are based on the theory that moral good is objective and independent of personal or merely human feelings" (Stufflebeam, Madaus, and Kellaghan, 2000, p.281). Stufflebeam & Coryn (2014) asserted that the CIPP evaluation model is a comprehensive series for use in formative and summative evaluations of various programs or projects, the CIPP Model of context evaluation is used to assess program objectives in accordance with reality, Input Evaluation is used to evaluate planning strategies, operational plans, resources, process evaluation assessments are used to evaluate program implementation, and product evaluations are used for useful results-oriented assessments or results that have a positive effect on the program.

## III. METHOD

This research was conducted at the Polytechnic of LP3I Jakarta and carried out for 15 months. The duration of 15 months is divided into several parts, namely: 1). Preliminary study of program assessment, 2). Submission of titles, proposal writing and proposal writing consultation, 3). Collection, processing, and analysis of findings, 4). Writing research reports. The program evaluation method used in this study is the CIPP evaluation model (Context, Input, Process, and Product). The instrument used as a gathering medium for findings in this study is interviews, observations and questionnaires. Quantitative methods act as supporting findings, namely in the form of questionnaires.

## IV. FINDINGS

The findings are presented in the four stages of the CIPP evaluation program. In context evaluation, findings and information on program policies and the legal basis for work placement, vision & mission, Strategic Plan, SOP and the objectives of the placement program are in accordance with applicable regulations. This input evaluation will outline a summary of findings based on gathering findings, conformity analysis with evaluation criteria and assessment and decisions covering 6 aspects, namely: Organizational Structure, Job Placement Procedure, Student Recruitment, Lecturer Readiness, Compilation of adequate Curriculum and Facilities and Infrastructure. Process evaluation discusses the selection process of students who will be placed, curriculum suitability, debriefing process, implementation of work placements, and reporting. While evaluation of results or products includes: a) Implementation of Student Competencies Placed, b) Absorption of Working Students, c) Work Ethics, d) Company Satisfaction, e) Benefits of the results of work placement programs in the company.

## V. DISCUSSIONS

### ➤ *Evaluation of Context*

Context evaluation of the work placement program of LP3I Polytechnic students (PLJ) includes four aspects, namely legal foundation, PLJ Vision, Mission, Strategic Plan and Student Job Placement Program Objectives. Based on the existing legal basis, namely: Law Number 17 of 2010 concerning Management and Organization of Education and Law No. 12 of 2012 article 16 concerning vocational education PLJ has also implemented the law by creating a work placement program. In its implementation, PLJ cooperates with the industrial world to channel third-level students (semester 5) to work or internship at the Company. In PLJ's Vision & Mission, it is to become a superior and innovative vocational university with work orientation and entrepreneurship in 2020. While PLJ's mission is to organize and develop vocational education that is quality, moral, competent and entrepreneurial, develops curricula to anticipate the needs of the workforce in the field management, business and technology,

developing and improving the quality of management of education based on the principles of good governance, carrying out research and community service for the development of knowledge and skills for the welfare of the community, developing and strengthening networks and partnerships at the national, regional and international, developing the quality of human resources to provide excellent service, increasing the quantity and quality of facilities and infrastructure to support the learning process that excels in the fields of management, business and technology. To realize the Vision Mission a work orientation is formulated in the form of a work placement program. Vision Mission has been well socialized to students, lecturers, education staff and stakeholders. The PLJ RENSTRA for 2016-2020 is listed in the education and teaching, research and community service policies that contain education and teaching improvement programs, with activities to collaborate to channel students / graduates to work and internships in the Company. The LP3I Jakarta Polytechnic Work Placement Program has a clear goal, namely to channel students to work in companies that are in accordance with their skills and competencies in their field. The final level of student work placement is an opportunity for students to further develop certain work skills, the foundation that has been laid in the previous study phase, and apply these skills in the work context (Nick Wilton, 2012).

#### ➤ *Evaluation of Input*

Input evaluation includes the planning of the Job Placement program whose discussion covers aspects: organizational structure, aspects of work placement procedures, student recruitment, aspects of readiness of lecturers, preparation of curriculum, facilities and infrastructure, mapping of companies. In the aspect of organizational structure found the Jakarta LP3I Polytechnic clearly shows the existence of the field of work placement within the PLJ organizational structure where the placement program is led by Deputy Director of Field III, namely Student Affairs, Marketing and Job Placement. In the field of Work Placement of Wadir III assisted by the Head of Employment Placement, Kabag Job Placement underlined 15 Heads of Fields (Kabid) Job Placement (C & P) in 15 LP3I Polytechnic development campuses in Jakarta. The Head of Section (Kabid) on the campus is fully responsible for the implementation of the student work placement program at the LP3I Polytechnic in Jakarta and reports to the Department of PLJ Job Placement. The Deputy Director of Field III is responsible for all student work placement programs and reports to the Director of the LP3I Polytechnic in Jakarta. In the PLJ organizational structure, it explains how work assignments for work placement will be divided, formally grouped and coordinated. The aspect of work placement refers to the work placement Standard Operating Procedure (SOP). This SOP is a working reference for the heads of regions and placement offices in carrying out the implementation of work placements (Ekotama, 2018). Student Recruitment Aspects are found in the results of the work placement program recruits are final-level students or third-level students. The selection of third-level students is because

they have gained sufficient skills and knowledge from semester 1 to semester IV and are in accordance with the requirements of work placement. The function of the PLJ Job Placement Section prepares students who already have work skills and competency certification from BNSP because in the recruitment process are selected and qualified students are determined to occupy positions or jobs in the company (Zainal, Ramly, Mutis and Arafah, 2015). The readiness aspects of lecturers, lecturers who teach at the LP3I Jakarta Polytechnic consist of practicing lecturers and academic lecturers who are in accordance with their fields. Jakarta LP3I Polytechnic has a lecturer ratio of 1: 32.5. The fixed lecturer ratio of PLJ is almost transparent with the fixed Lecturer Ratio contained in the Circular of the Republic of Indonesia Minister of Research, Technology and Higher Education Number: 105 / M / VI / 2015, which states that the ideal ratio of study programs is 1: 20 for exact and 1: 30 for social science with a tolerance of 50%. From the questionnaire with 163 respondents, students showed that out of 9 criteria only three were considered very good, namely students agreed that the lecturers who taught at the LP3I Polytechnic in Jakarta mastered the lecture material. Students assessed very well the ability to deliver lecture material. instructional Media. While the 6 criteria are considered good, namely the students assess well on the ability of the lecturer to create an active atmosphere, Students assess both the method used by the lecturer in accordance with the lecture material (practice or theory), Students assess the lecturers who teach in the PLJ some S2 graduates, Students It is good for the lecturers to come from academics and practitioners who are competent in their fields. Students assess the lecturers' competencies according to the lecture material they are teaching and Students assess the number of lecturers in the Jakarta PLJ is sufficient with the number of students currently available. The curriculum aspect was found that in the preparation of the LP3I Jakarta Polytechnic curriculum involving industry, the aim was to harmonize the desired needs of the company such as competence or work skills with the contents of the curriculum to be compiled. The reason, industry or company is the user of the products produced by PLJ. The content of the PLJ curriculum for Semester 1 through semester 4 is oriented towards work skills while for semester 5 and 6 the content is general and insightful. From questionnaires 163 Respondents (working students) Preparation of the curriculum includes three evaluation criteria. The three evaluation criteria have good value, namely the conformity of the course material that has been taught with the demands of the world of work and business, the conformity of the curriculum that is compiled refers to the principles of relevance, dynamism, and measurability, which are oriented to the lives of students in society in general. Strategic demands include developing the ability to work in the company and the suitability of curriculum content in shaping the character of students. The results of interviews, documentation and questionnaires, overall aspects of the curriculum are considered good. The facilities and infrastructure aspects found that the LP3I Jakarta Polytechnic has educational facilities and infrastructure that are sufficient. From the 163 questionnaires with students as

respondents, the aspects of facilities and infrastructure included 9 evaluation criteria. The seven evaluation criteria assessed were room capacity, comfort of the lecture room or classroom, the convenience of the lecture room for lab / practice space, cleanliness and the number of toilets was very adequate, the mosque was adequate and clean, providing an adequate laboratory for student practice activities, PLJ Jakarta (campus) always follows the developments by renewing facilities (practice equipment) for practice activities and the existence of laboratories or practice rooms is very helpful in adding skills to work in the company. The two evaluation semesters were considered to be quite good, namely the availability of collections of books in the library in accordance with the department and the services provided by the lab staff to students. The aspect of mapping the company for work placement was found to be the result that a work placement program could be implemented if there was a demand for labor from the company. The demand for labor comes from companies that have or have not collaborated with the Polytechnic LP3I Jakarta.

#### ➤ *Evaluation of Process*

The aspect of the student selection process that will be placed is carried out by the job placement section to select candidates or final level students who are sent to take the entrance examination at the Company. The candidates sent must be in accordance with the qualifications needed by the company. here are three stages, namely the first stage classifies the student GPA value based on the size. The grouping is a group of compulsory work students, namely students who have a GPA value between 3.00-4.00, a group of compulsory internships, namely students who have a GPA between 2.75 - 2.99 and a group of student students assisted by an internship namely students who have a GPA between 2.00- 2.74. The second stage is all level III students must meet general requirements such as 1) Students placed are Semester V students, 2) Have 4 Certifications (Computer Certification, English Language Certification, Field Certification), 3) Have a Religious Mentoring Certificate, 4) Age maximum of 25 years, 4) Not physically and mentally disabled, 5) Does not have D value, 6) Has Soft Skill certificate held by the Job Placement Section, 7) Has 2 seminar certificates must be 8) Has attended KKI. While the third stage of the job placement section interviews students who will take the entrance examination in the company with the aim of knowing the readiness of students before being sent to the company for the test. After being declared ready by the placement department, the candidate is sent to the company to take the test. In the selection process carried out internally, the selection process for whether or not candidates are employed or interned is in the selection process at the company's HRD. With this condition the company is quite helped because it does not require a lot of effort to recruit and select the right candidates according to the desired qualifications. The above process is considered to be the most helpful for the company (Kang & Shen, 2013). The conformity aspect of the curriculum states that the curriculum designed by the curriculum compilation team (Head of Study Program and Lecturer Team) and the

industry is aligned with the needs of the industry so that the curriculum is designed to produce effective apprenticeship guidelines (Albashiry, Voogt & Pieters, 2015). The debriefing aspect aims to equip students with knowledge and skills outside of lecture material or curriculum to prepare students for work placements or internships in the company. This debriefing process starts from the first semester (Level I) to Semester IV (Level II). Providers of debriefing materials consist of the internal material giver is the material giver from the practitioner lecturer, while the material giver from the external is the material giver from the company that is the company management (director or manager of the company HRD). The achievement of debriefing objectives also depends on the internal material giver (Practitioner) and external (Director or HRD Manager) who has experience in the field and has the ability to teach. The debriefing material in the form of soft skills debriefing can support the knowledge material obtained during lectures so that it is useful when students enter the workforce (Barthorpe & Hall, 2000). Aspects of the implementation of work placements, the implementation of work placements there are several stages, the first stage is students pass the screening test, Screening test is an evaluation tool that aims to detect as early as possible the abilities and skills of students and to find out the weaknesses and advantages of each student before work . If in the results of the screening test there are several students who do not meet the requirements or less grades, the student will be given an upgrading program, namely a stabilization program or increasing competency by providing material whose value is less. The second stage is the part of the work placement company that asks for HR needs with criteria, needs and positions that request and sort the CV or sort out the students according to the criteria requested by the company. The third stage of the student CV is sent to the company and the Job Placement Section contacts the candidate or student who fits the criteria desired by the company to take the test or interview. Before students take the test or interview they are given an explanation of qualifications, positions and information about the company. Fourth stage The work placement section leads students to the company to take a test at the Company and introduce students to the Company's HRD Section. The fifth stage The company will contact the work placement department regarding the results of student tests at the Company and the work placement section will contact students whether they pass or not. For students who have not successfully passed the selection test or are not accepted by the company, the job placement department must find the cause of the student's failure by contacting the company's HRD or analyzing the company's test results. students will be given retraining in accordance with the material that failed and students will be given the opportunity to take 10 tests at the Company. The results of the questionnaire on the aspects of the implementation of work placements include six criteria, namely students assess well that in getting job information from the job placement section. Reporting aspect, each PLJ job placement department reports on work placements, Fill in the report on how many requests for labor are requested by the company, how many students work or internships, how

many are unsuccessful, Reports on student development during work or internships in company by company HRD, reports in the form of time discipline, cooperation, behavior, initiative and creative and responsibility. Kabid Report Work placements are routine and are issued based on time periods, namely: weekly reports, quarterly reports and annual reports.

#### ➤ *Evaluation of Product*

Aspects Implementation of student competencies placed in work shows that students who work or internships in the company can apply or apply the skills and knowledge acquired in lectures at work. Thus, employers will not hesitate to employ college graduates who have work skills and are also competent in implementing these skills to create a good work environment to achieve better company performance (Abas & Imam, 2016). There are 4 competencies that students must have, namely competence to operate computers, Competence in English, Competencies in expertise fields 1 and 2 that are in accordance with their respective study programs. From the results of the questionnaire 163 students who have worked, assessing both the work skills acquired in the lecture are very helpful and can be applied in their work and feel helped by their competencies. From the Aspects of Absorption of Working Students, it can be seen from the findings in September 2018 as many as 1,919 students have graduated. Students who have worked and internships in the Company as much as 90% of the number of students graduated. Through the work placement program 90% of PLJ students are absorbed in the Industry. With this absorption rate (90%) it shows that the LP3I Jakarta Polytechnic has been quite successful in achieving its vision and purpose as a vocational university that prepares and distributes its students to work in the Industry and realize students work before being released. Thus the work placement program at PLJ also provides opportunities for students to prepare themselves for the world of work. The most important thing is that the program is able to provide students the opportunity to test their readiness in the world of work (Inceuglua, Selenkob, McDowall & Schlachter, 2018). From the findings of interviews with several companies regarding the work ethic of the students, it was shown that almost all students or graduates of the LP3I Jakarta Polytechnic were working and working in and out of the office on time. They are able to appreciate time and take responsibility for their work. Students show good adaptability. It is seen that students have a good work ethic. The aspect of corporate satisfaction is seen based on a survey of 76 companies. The company feels quite satisfied with the work skills of employees who come from Jakarta Polytechnic LP3I students at 82%. The benefit aspect of the work placement program in the company is that the program is beneficial for students in the form of opportunities to apply the skills acquired in lectures, add skills, learn to adapt to the work environment, and be able to train discipline. In addition, they also get income that is used to help parents pay their tuition fees.

## VI. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

From the results of this study it can be concluded that the Student Work Placement Program at the LP3I Polytechnic in Jakarta as a whole is going well. The data obtained in this study not only uses the acquisition of qualitative data, but also uses quantitative methods to measure changes in student behavior significantly. To make efforts to improve the implementation of the work placement program, the following recommendations are given:

1. In context evaluation, it is recommended to add a statement to the objectives of the work placement program in writing in the SOP
2. In input evaluation, it is recommended that PLJ recruit more practicing lecturers from the company.
3. At process evaluation, it is recommended in the implementation of work placements in the company regarding Screening tests or evaluation tools to detect as early as possible the abilities and skills of students with the aim of knowing the weaknesses and advantages of each student before being placed into work.

## REFERENCES

- [1]. Abas, M. C., & Imam, O. A. (2016). Graduates' Competence on Employability Skills and Job Performance. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education (IJERE)*, 5(2), 119–125. Retrieved from <http://iaesjournal.com/online/index.php/IJERE>
- [2]. Brooks, R., & Youngson, P. L. (2016). Undergraduate work placements: an analysis of the effects on career progression. *Studies in Higher Education*, 41(9), 1563–1578. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2014.988702>
- [3]. Badan Pusat Statistik.(2017). *Statistik Indonesia 2017*. Jakarta: Badan Pusat Statistik.
- [4]. Barthorpe, S., & Hall, M. (2000). A collaborative approach to placement preparation and career planning for university students: A case study. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 52(2), 165–175. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820000200113>
- [5]. Clark, M., & Zukas, M. (2016). Understanding successful sandwich placements: A Bourdieusian approach. *Studies in Higher Education*, 41(7), 1281–1295. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2014.968121>
- [6]. Ekotama, Suryono. (2018). *Matinya Perusahaan Gara-gara SOP*, Jakarta: PT. elex Media Komputindo
- [7]. Inceoglu, I. (2016). ( How ) Do Work Placements Work ? Scrutinizing the Quantitative Evidence with a Systematic Review ( How ) Do work placements work? Scrutinizing the quantitative evidence for a theory-driven future research agenda. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 320787882(December 2018), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2018.09.002>
- [8]. Ibashiry, N. M., Voogt, J. M., & Pieters, J. M. (2015). Teacher collaborative curriculum design in technical vocational colleges: a strategy for maintaining curriculum consistency? *Curriculum*

- Journal*, 26(4), 601–624.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09585176.2015.1058281>
- [9]. Kang, H., & Shen, J. (2013). International recruitment and selection practices of South Korean multinationals in China. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 24(17), 3325–3342.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2013.770777>
- [10]. Nick Wilton. (2012). The impact of work placements on skills development and labour market outcomes for business and management graduates. *Studies in Higher Education*, 37(5), 603–620.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2010.532548>
- [11]. Stufflebeam, D. L. (2000). The CIPP Model for Evaluation. In D. L. Stufflebeam, G. F. Madaus, & T. Kellaghan (Eds.), *Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational And Human Services Evaluation*. Boston, MA: Kluwer Academic.
- [12]. Stufflebeam, D. L., & Coryn, C. L. S. (2014). *Evaluation theory, models, and applications* (2nd ed.). San Francisco, CA, US: Jossey-Bass.
- [13]. Undang-undang Nomor 12 Tahun 2012 tentang Pendidikan Tinggi